Debating Emancipation

Author: Suzanne Manning, Moore West Jr. High School, Oklahoma (adapted from President Lincoln’s Cottage)

Target Grades: 6-8
Lesson Length: 1-2 days

Introduction:
Students learn to annotate a historical speech to identify and articulate the author’s point of view. This lesson should precede a reading activity on the Emancipation Proclamation.

Learning Objectives:
- Students will identify key issues involved in working through emancipation, including the consequences (pros and cons) of the Lincoln administration changing its position from preventing slavery in new territories/states to eradicating slavery in states in rebellion.
- Students will identify key figures (in addition to Lincoln) involved in the process of emancipating slaves and how emancipation would affect different areas of the government (military, financial, international relations, etc.)

Guiding Questions:
- How did President Lincoln and his cabinet members work through the issue of emancipation? What were their various positions and did they change their approaches to the issue of slavery?

Common Core Standards:
- **Literacy Skills Standard 1** - The student will develop and demonstrate Common Core Social Studies reading literacy skills.
  LS 1.A: Key Ideas and Details - Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary of the source distinct from prior knowledge or opinions.
- **Literacy Skills Standard 2** - The student will develop and demonstrate Common Core Social Studies writing literacy skills.
  LS A.1: Text Types and Purposes - Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content. a. Introduce claim(s) about a topic or issue, acknowledge and distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically. b. Support claim(s) with logical reasoning and relevant, accurate data and evidence that demonstrate an understanding of the topic or text, using credible sources. c. Use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.
C3 Framework:
- C3 Standards (PDF)
- D1.5.6-8. Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of views represented in the sources.
- D2.Civ.3.6-8. Examine the origins, purposes, and impact of constitutions, laws, treaties, and international agreements.
- D2.His.4.6-8. Analyze multiple factors that influenced the perspectives of people during different historical eras.
- D3.3.6-8. Identify evidence that draws information from multiple sources to support claims, noting evidentiary limitations.
- D4.1.6-8. Construct arguments using claims and evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging the strengths and limitations of the arguments.

Oklahoma Social Studies Content Standards
- Oklahoma Content Standard (OKCS) 5: The student will analyze the social and political transformation of the United States as a result of the causes, course, and consequences of the American Civil War during the period of 1850 to 1865.
- OKCS 5.4: Identify and summarize the consequences of the major turning points of the war including the…
- OKCS 5.4.B: Battle of Antietam as a catalyst for the issuance of the Emancipation Proclamation and its role in expanding the goals of the war to include the ending of slavery

Materials:
- Class copies of Lincoln’s first inaugural address
- Definition of “emancipation” displayed
- Internet-connected devices with links to President Lincoln’s Cottage resources, providing information on Lincoln’s cabinet members’ beliefs, roles and positions on emancipation
  Lincoln’s Toughest Decisions: Cabinet Member Information
- Large Post-It paper for groups to write an Emancipation Proclamation or Deny Emancipation based on their decisions after debating the topic as a Cabinet.
- For Instructor: President Lincoln Cottage Lesson Guide for Emancipation Lesson (to follow this lesson)
- Primary Source Analysis Tools (SOAPSTone and/or Library of Congress Tools, included)

Procedures:
Lesson Activity One: The Cabinet – A Team of Rivals
- Within their groups, students are assigned Cabinet roles
- Review meaning of “emancipation” and review Lincoln’s First Inaugural Address
- Quick introduction by Instructor of Lincoln’s Cabinet officials, their roles, and influences.
  o Andrew Johnson, Vice-President
  o William Seward, Secretary of State
  o Edwin M. Stanton, Secretary of War
  o Edward Bates, Attorney General
  o Montgomery Blair, Postmaster General
  o Salmon P. Chase, Secretary of Treasure
  o Gideon Welles, Secretary of Navy

**Lesson Activity Two: Debating Emancipation**
- Students read information on Internet-connected devices relating to their specific assigned Cabinet member and form arguments regarding Emancipation
- Students debate w/in their groups the issue of Emancipation based on the date, and their individual beliefs and roles at the time.

**Lesson Activity Three: Emancipation Proclamation or Inauguration Affirmation**
- Each group decides if they will “affirm” Lincoln’s stance in his Inaugural address that he would not attack the institution of slavery in states where it already existed; or if they will issue an “Emancipation Proclamation.” Decisions will be based on majority rule.
- Students must then write an official Declaration based on their decision, stating the path that will be taken by the Administration and the reasoning to support it. This will serve as the “Assessment” for this lesson. They should write with a unified voice, as if they were the one man, Lincoln, writing based on the decisions of the group.
- The following day’s lesson will be a reading of Lincoln’s actual Emancipation Proclamation.

### Debating Emancipation Rubric

#### Emancipation Proclamation or Inauguration Affirmation Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Declaration</strong></td>
<td>Provides a clear and concise declaration of their decision.</td>
<td>Provides a somewhat clear declaration of their decision.</td>
<td>Provides an ambiguous declaration of their decision.</td>
<td>No declaration is made by the Cabinet group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reasoning</strong></td>
<td>Provides, at least, three detailed arguments defending the declaration.</td>
<td>Provides at least two detailed arguments defending the declaration.</td>
<td>Weak defense of declaration – few arguments with little explanation.</td>
<td>No supporting reasoning to defend declaration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Syntax</strong></td>
<td>Correct, grammar, spelling, and punctuation are used in writing declaration; and excellent penmanship.</td>
<td>Few errors in grammar, spelling, and punctuation when writing declaration; and legible penmanship.</td>
<td>Multiple errors in grammar, spelling, and punctuation when writing declaration; and a little hard to read.</td>
<td>Extreme errors in grammar, spelling, and punctuation when writing declaration; and very hard to read.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Points:** /12

**Comments, Suggestions, Questions:**
### Library of Congress Primary Source Analysis Tool

#### PRIMARY SOURCE ANALYSIS TOOL

**Format:** Any Format

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>O BSERVE</th>
<th>R EFLECT</th>
<th>Q UESTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### FURTHER INVESTIGATION

---

Debating Emancipation

### S.O.A.P.S. Tone Primary Source Analysis Tool (AP Resource)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Column 1</th>
<th>Column 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>S</strong></td>
<td>What is the subject?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What are the general topics or ideas?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>O</strong></td>
<td>What is the occasion?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What are the time, place, and setting of the piece?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A</strong></td>
<td>Who is the audience?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To whom is the piece directed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>P</strong></td>
<td>What is the purpose?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What is the reason this was written/spoken?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>S</strong></td>
<td>Who is the speaker?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Who is the voice or author?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tone</strong></td>
<td>What is the tone of the piece?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What is the attitude or tone of the piece?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>